OFFICIAL MINUTES OF THE SCHOOL COMMITTEE MEETING

December 13, 2017

The Boston School Committee held a meeting on December 13, 2017 at 6 p.m. at the Bruce C. Bolling Municipal Building, 2300 Washington Street, School Committee chamber, Roxbury, Massachusetts. For more information about any of the items listed below, visit www.bostonpublicschools.org, email feedback@bostonpublicschools.org or call the Boston School Committee Office at (617) 635-9014.

ATTENDANCE

School Committee Members Present: Chairperson Michael D. O’Neill; Vice Chair Hardin Coleman; Michael Loconto; Jeri Robinson; Regina Robinson; Dr. Miren Uriarte (departed prior to action items); and student representative Keondre McClay.

School Committee Member Absent: Alexandra Oliver-Dávila.

DOCUMENTS PRESENTED

School Committee Presentation: BSC-AFSCME Tentative Agreement Power Point, December 6, 2017

School Committee Presentation: BSC – School Police Patrolmen Tentative Agreement Power Point, December 13, 2017

Memo from Superintendent Chang to Boston School Committee re: Boston School Police Patrolmen Association Collective Bargaining Agreement, December 11, 2017

MOA Highlights: Boston School Committee and the Boston School Police Patrolmen Association

Memorandum of Agreement between the School Committee of the City of Boston and the Boston School Police Patrolmen Association 2016-2017

Memorandum of Agreement between the School Committee of the City of Boston and the Boston School Police Patrolmen Association 2017-2020

Cost out of Collective Bargaining Agreement between the School Committee of the City of Boston and the Boston School Police Patrolmen Association - FY 2017- FY 2020
CALL TO ORDER

Mr. O’Neill led the pledge of allegiance and called the meeting to order.

CITATIONS

The Committee and Superintendent presented citations to the following BPS employees who earned doctorates in 2017:

- Amalio C. Nieves, Assistant Superintendent, Office of Social Emotional Learning and Wellness
- Henry Oppong, Safe and Welcoming Schools Specialist, Office of Social Emotional and Wellness
- Natasha Halfkenny, E/LA & Civics Inclusion Teacher, Edison K-8 School
- Daniel Mahoney, Physical Education Teacher, Otis and Bradley Elementary schools
- Charmie Curry, Professional Growth Specialist, Office of Human Capital
- Patricia Chouinard, Spanish Master, Boston Latin School
- Tamara Blake-Canty, principal, Russell Elementary School
Thank you all for joining us this evening. Given that this is our last meeting before the holiday break, I would like to wish everyone here a happy and healthy holiday season.

I would like to begin by sharing some great news. Today, the Massachusetts School Building Authority (MSBA) voted in favor of a construction of a new facility for Boston Arts Academy, the city’s only public performing arts high school. This is a major milestone in the MSBA process, and for Mayor Marty Walsh, whose administration launched this project. The total cost of construction will be $124 million; and the MSBA is expected to reimburse the City with $48 million. The new facility, which will be on the current Fenway site, will accommodate 500 students, and provide for performance spaces that the school does not currently have, including a 200-seat black box theater, a 500-seat auditorium, four dance studios, a recording studio, and much more.

The MSBA also voted to allow the Carter School to enter the eligibility period to begin the process for the construction of a new school. As many of you know, the Carter School serves students with severe special needs and is currently housed in an outdated building that was not originally intended to serve a severe special needs population. Finally, the MSBA also voted to extend the feasibility study for the Josiah Quincy Upper School, which includes finding a location for the future school site. Congratulations to everyone involved in these three projects. I know that, particularly for the BAA community, this vote was a long time coming and it is a very exciting time for that school.

Now, I’ll move onto a topic that is on the minds of many — start and end times for next year. Yesterday, I issued a letter to families updating them on the implementation of start and end time changes. I also sent a communication to the School Committee, along with an analysis from the BPS Office of Equity, which was conducted to make sure that our new start times provide equity across racial and socioeconomic lines throughout the district. I will get to that in a moment.

Since we announced next year’s start times, we have heard a tremendous amount of feedback from parents across the city. Last night, I met with leadership from the Citywide Parent Council,
DELAC (District English Learner Advisory Committee), and SPEDPAC (Special Education Parent Advisory Council) to speak with parents about their questions and concerns.

I want to acknowledge what we are hearing. The dominant feedback is that many parents feel a 7:15 AM start is too early for their students. However, I want to acknowledge that I have also heard from many parents who are happy with their new times, whether they begin as early as 7:15 a.m. or as late as 9:30 a.m. We have also heard from many people who are very happy to hear that high schools will start later.

I want the School Committee — and the parents of this city — to know that we are deeply committed to working with families to ensure these transitions are as smooth as possible. Right now, the BPS Office of Extended Learning Time is working to increase the number of before- and after-school programming at our elementary and K-8 schools with the biggest scheduling changes. Our major before- and after-school partners, including the YMCA, the Boys and Girls Club, the Boston Center for Youth and Families (BCYF), and others, are working closely with us to make sure programming is available where there is increased need. The district is committed to reinvesting a portion of the savings created by the new start and end times into expanding before- or after-school programming where needed. For our middle and high school students, the BPS Athletics Department worked with us to make sure after-school sports will not be impacted by later school dismissals.

Let me come back to why we are making these scheduling changes in the first place. In the Boston Public Schools, our core mission is to close opportunity and achievement gaps. In everything that we do, we must create systems and environments that set up all students for success — academically, socially, and emotionally. This includes everything from making sure students are connected to the right learning materials, to making sure they have access to fresh, healthy food, and, in this case, making sure their school schedules align with their biological needs.

There is an extensive amount of research that shows adolescents need eight and a half (8.5) to nine and a half (9.5) hours of sleep per night, and that their natural sleep patterns result in needing to sleep later than our younger students. Allowing adolescents to sleep later not only helps them become more attentive in school, it lowers their risk for dropping out, it lowers their risk for depression and anxiety, it lowers their risk for obesity, it decreases the number of car crashes, and it decreases rates of substance abuse.

On the other end, the School Committee asked us to move school end times earlier for elementary school students. With 57 elementary schools adding instructional minutes this year through Extended Learning Time (ELT), many of our students are getting out of school after 4 p.m.

In addition, there is research that shows elementary school students are not affected as much by earlier start times. While this research is less extensive than research around high school sleep patterns, there is emerging evidence that shows pre-adolescents are more alert and ready to learn earlier in the morning than students in middle and high school.
Transportation is clearly a major factor in all of these scheduling changes. Even though most of the middle and high school students walk or take the MBTA, roughly 20% of our secondary students still receive service on our school buses — this includes students with special needs, or students receiving shuttles to MBTA stations.

We have heard time and time again that BPS spends too much money on transportation. In order to achieve meaningful, positive, system-wide change, it is not possible to change bell times without having an impact on the majority of schools. The reality is that BPS is a school-choice district that relies on an interconnected transportation system to implement this model. This transportation system costs us more than $110 million a year and the School Committee has asked us, rightfully so, to find ways to be more efficient with transportation so we can invest more into schools.

Now, let me get back to the Equity Analysis that I mentioned earlier. First, I would like to thank the Office of Equity for examining our start- and end-time plan for next year. I urge you all to view the Equity Analysis, which is currently on our Start Times website: bostonpublicschools.org/starttimes. This analysis highlights that the new bell times are more equally distributed than the current bell times among racial and socioeconomic groups, and that geographic areas of the city have a better choice of bell time options.

One of the problems we face now is that there is a lack of variety in bell times in certain neighborhoods. It is not perfect, but the new plan does allow for a variety of start times in many neighborhoods.

For example, if you look at Hyde Park, we went from all five elementary schools starting at 8:30 this year to each school starting within 15 minute intervals between 7:15 and 9:30 next year. In the analysis, there is an interesting data point, which shows that currently, in grades K-6, the only racial group with a majority of students with the most optimal start time, which is between 8:00 and 9:00 AM, are white students at 53%. Currently, 37% of Black K-6 student start school at that same time slot. Also, currently, 10% of white K-6 students start school before 8:00 AM, while 31% of black K-6 students start school before 8:00 AM. Next year, this will be much more racially balanced because race was not used as a factor in the scheduling of new start times. This inequity was due to a legacy of scheduling practices that were absent of deep equity analysis across the system.

As we move forward, we will continue to assess the equity implications of the new start and end times across the system. We are going to monitor factors such as:

- Transfer rates and shifts in enrollment, particularly at the schools with the largest changes;
- Student achievement through a range of measures, including test scores and graduation rates;
- And other indicators such as tardiness, attendance, violence, obesity, diabetes, depression, and drug use.

Despite all of this information, I very much understand that for many families, these new times will be a huge transition. It is our job, as an administration and as a district, to do everything we
can to ease this transition for families and set them up for success. We are committed to that. We are hosting a series of community meetings next week to address concerns around the new start times. We have posted those times on our website www.BostonPublicSchools.org/StartTimes and publicized them in the parent letter that was issued yesterday. We are also responding to the phone calls and emails we are receiving regarding this issue.

Right now, there are rooms set up outside of the School Committee Chambers where parents can receive one-on-one support from our staff about the start time changes. Any time there is a major structural change like this, it requires everyone to make shifts and it can feel very disruptive. At the end of the day, I want to assure parents that we are making these changes because it is what we truly feel is best for all students in Boston Public Schools. BPS stands with you, and will be here to help families over the next nine months. As I mentioned earlier, I urge anyone with questions to attend our community meetings next week, which are being held in multiple locations around the city. Visit BostonPublicSchools.org/StartTimes and click on “Community Meetings” for a list of locations.

Thank you for listening.

Despite the snow, we had an excellent turnout at the BPS Citywide K-12 School Showcase on Saturday. We had about 1,100 students, parents, and guardians, along with 350 staff members. The Showcase kicks off our school registration season. Every school in the district was represented at the event, which was held at the T.D. Garden. This was a great opportunity for families to learn more about their school options for next year. I hope that parents who are in the process of picking a school for next year also attend a School Preview Day, when parents can visit the schools they are considering. All BPS schools are hosting School Preview Days at various times now through the end of January. You can find the entire list of locations, dates, and times online at bostonpublicschools.org/registrationevents. I’d like to thank the Office of Engagement for doing a great job organizing the Showcase and all of our school choice events.

Last week, schools across BPS participated in Hour of Code, a global event aimed at promoting computer science for students — learning the basics through 1-hour activities that can expand into all sorts of innovative learning. I was delighted to see so many BPS teachers and staff members posting about their Hour of Code activities on social media. There are so many examples of our schools connecting our students to the STEAM skills that will give them access to the Innovation Economy. It’s a joy to see the excitement on the students’ faces as they dive into real-world learning experiences. I’d like to thank all of the teachers and our Digital Learning Team staff from the Office of Instructional and Information Technology (OIIT) for all of their work in facilitating Hour of Code.

Tonight is the second night of Hanukkah, and as we head toward Christmas, Kwanzaa, New Years, and the other major holidays, I’d like to take a brief moment to acknowledge all of those around BPS who are making the holiday season a little brighter for our students, families, staff, and community. I’d like to thank the many schools and departments around the district that are holding clothing and gift drives, and other events to help our neediest families celebrate the season.
The Office of Engagement, with the strong support of Sociedad Latina, continues to help our families who recently arrived from Puerto Rico. The Mayor's Office is holding a Three Kings Day (El Dia de los Tres Reyes) celebration for these families at City Hall on January 5th, where they will be provided gifts, resources, and the Three Kings will be on hand for the children. Additionally, BPS is arranging for some gifts to be given to the families for Christmas from Toys for Tots. Also, the Belmont Hill School has adopted two families to provide them gifts for the holiday season.

The BPS Behavioral Health Department recently collected enough clothing to assist 26 students through a clothing drive with Cradles to Crayons. Tomorrow, there is a Holiday Gathering hosted by the BPS Homeless Education Resource Network at the Mildred Ave. School, where Wally the Green Monster, from the Red Sox, will be helping to hand out gifts to 400 low-income students.

Also, this Friday, the annual student holiday music and dance performances will be held here in the lobby of the Bolling Municipal Building from 11 a.m. – 1 p.m. We will have students here from the Chittick, Mather, Josiah Quincy, O’Bryant, Boston Latin Academy, Charlestown High, and West Zone Early Learning Center. That concludes my report for this evening.

Ms. Regina Robinson thanked the Superintendent for his report, saying that change is hard. She added that her children are scheduled to have multiple different start times next year, and that she is open to seeing how it will work out.

Dr. Uriarte said she believes that the school start time policy as sound and invited parents to read the district’s equity analysis. She praised the Superintendent’s commitment to work closely with families on implementation. She requested periodic updates from the Superintendent on implementation. She said that research is absent on the impact on impact of early school start times on elementary school students and asked the Superintendent to provide more information regarding the monitoring and evaluation of the plan.

Mr. Loconto said that the Committee understands that the school start time shift is a big change for many families, adding that the policy is a meaningful one based upon research and input from BPS families.

Ms. Jeri Robinson said that the Committee thought carefully about the policy, adding that perhaps the Committee should have examined potential new bus times prompted by the new bell times.

Dr. Coleman requested an ongoing evaluation of the start times implementation.

Mr. O’Neill thanked everyone who wrote to the Committee communicating the impact that the new start times will have on their families. He said that the Committee is committed to working with the Superintendent to address the concerns that have been raised.

The School Committee approved the Superintendent’s Report by unanimous consent.
GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT

The following people testified expressing concerns about changes to school start times beginning in school year 2018-19:

- MA State Representative Edward Coppinger
- Boston City Councilor Matt O’Malley
- Boston City Councilor Annissa Essaibi-George
- Gisele Pena, parent, Hernandez K-8 School
- Susan Lombardi Verticelli, parent, Hernandez K-8
- Antonia Rodriguez, BPS parent
- Yajaira Rodriguez Hernandez, BPS parent
- Lynnelle Pittet, parent, Winship Elementary School
- Audrey Martínez-Gudapakkam, parent, Winship Elementary School
- Erin Birmingham Anadu, parent, Manning Elementary School
- Jane Miller, parent, Manning Elementary School
- Ronan Miller, student, Manning Elementary School
- Tommy Hayes, parent, Haley K-8 Pilot School
- MA State Senator Michael Rush
- Erik Gehring, parent, Lyndon K-8 School
- Julie Muse-Fischer, parent, Lyndon K-8 School
- Tigran Eldred, parent, Manning Elementary School
- Steve Poftak, Lyndon K-8 School
- Deborah Putnam, parent, Boston Latin Academy, and chapter leader, Start School Later
- Carolyn Kain, chair, SpedPAC, and parent, Henderson Inclusion K-12 School
- Kristin Butke, parent, Lyndon K-8
- Maria Dominguez Gray, parent, Haley K-8 Pilot School
- McKenzie Reed, student, Hernandez K-8 School
- Christine Chafers, parent, Lyndon K-8 School
- Nancy Laste, parent, Mission Hill K-8 School
- Kerry Hawkins, parent, Eliot K-8 School
- Ashley Mahanana, parent, Eliot K-8 School, and Citywide Parent Council representative
- Dominic Doyle, parent, Lyndon K-8 School
- Patrick Banfield, parent, Mendell Elementary School
- Victoria Hom, parent, Gardner Pilot Academy
- Priscilla Anderson, parent, Gardner Pilot Academy
- Barbara O’Toole, parent, Lyndon K-8 School
- Samantha Bartle, parent, Eliot K-8 School
- Dasan Harrington, parent, Russell Elementary School
- Christopher Fung, parent, Russell Elementary School
- Israel Ruiz, parent, and chair, Governing Board, Eliot K-8 School
- Alejandra Hung, parent, Mendell Elementary School,
December 13, 2017

- Clara Latham, parent, Haley Pilot K-8 School
- Rebecca Kiley, parent, Hernandez K-8 School
- Neal Klineman, parent, Gardner Pilot Academy
- Matt Payette, parent, Lyndon K-8 School
- Michael McGuire, parent, Haley K-8 Pilot School
- Krista Magnuson, parent, John F. Kennedy Elementary School
- Johanna Haney, parent, Manning Elementary School
- Bob Goodman, parent, Mission Hill K-8 School
- Sarah Horsley, parent, John F. Kennedy School; Ms. Horsley also read a statement on behalf of Hannah Thomas, parent, Mission Hill K-8 School
- Marie Mercurio, parent, Mendell Elementary School
- Meg Vulliez, parent, Sumner Elementary School
- Bethany Van Delft, parent, Henderson Inclusion K-12 School
- Deborah Aguayo Delgado, teacher, Quincy Elementary School
- Andrea Atkinson, parent, Hernandez K-8 School
- Anna Maria, parent, Boston Teachers Union School
- Kellie McNulty, parent, Lyndon K-8 School
- Sherry Pedone, teacher, Mildred Avenue K-8 School
- Karin McEwen, parent, Manning Elementary School
- Marg Day, parent, Manning Elementary School
- Amanda Warren, parent, Mission Hill K-8 School
- Meghan Stark, parent, Condon K-8 School
- Hindy Pilwah, BPS parent
- Jovan Lacet, BPS parent
- Jake Dempsey, parent, Gardner Pilot Academy
- Richard Tenby, parent, Eliot K-8 School

The following teachers from the Lilla G. Frederick Middle School testified regarding grade configurations:

- Melissa Hamilton
- Ruth Lynn
- Katie Kersey
- Emily Hanke
- Arianna McCarthy
- Sharif Williams
- Alice Laramore

Tom Carco, teacher, P.A. Shaw Elementary School, testified regarding his concerns about the Superintendent’s feeder pattern proposal to the Mildred Avenue K-8 School.

Raquel Ayala, parent, Madison Park Technical Vocational High School, testified in support of the school’s Executive Director Kevin McCaskill.
Janette Hasan and Deborah Allabi, students, Lyndon K-8 School, testified regarding their civics project about sexual harassment.

Colm Prendergast, FIRST robotics mentor, advocated for the reinstatement of teacher Ellie May O’Toole and her STEM programs.

Peggy Wiesenberg, citizen, testified in favor of adding one grade per year to the Mattapan Early Elementary School.

Mr. O’Neill thanked parents who testified and listened in the audience, saying that parent engagement is critical. He said that the Committee is committed working with the district on how and when to implement the policy.

Mr. Loconto suggested that the Superintendent consider the comments heard tonight and work with the Committee and the City around implementation.

Dr. Uriarte said that the Committee takes parent feedback seriously, adding that she believes there is a difference between what the Committee voted on last week and what she is hearing tonight from parents.

Superintendent Chang thanked parents for coming. He said that the School Committee approved a strong policy, admitting that there are challenges with way the district implemented the policy. He said that he and his team will take time to reflect upon the concerns raised that evening and will continue to listen at a series of district-sponsored community meetings next week.

Mr. O’Neill said that Superintendent Chang is deeply committed to the children of Boston and asked families to assume good intent.

Ms. Jeri Robinson said that she was encouraged to see schools coming together as stronger communities.

Ms. Regina Robinson praised the parent engagement and echoed the concerns raised by some parents about the impact early start times could have on students with disabilities.

Dr. Coleman cautioned that if the district decides to make changes to the start time plan, leaders must fully understand the implications those changes will have on transportation costs.

At 11:40 p.m., Mr. O’Neill announced that the Committee would take a brief recess. The Committee returned to public session at approximately 12 a.m.
ACTION ITEMS

Approved – The Committee unanimously approved, by roll call, a collective bargaining agreement between the Boston School Committee and the American Federation of State, County, and Municipal Employees (AFSCME) effective from September 1, 2016 – August 31, 2020.

Report and Action Item – Tentative Collective Bargaining Agreement between the Boston School Committee and the Boston School Police Patrolmen Association -BPS Labor Relations Director Karen Glasgow provided a brief overview of the agreement, describing the contract as fair, equitable, and affordable.

Mr. Loconto praised the contract as a good deal for all parties, calling it fiscally responsible.

Approved – The Committee unanimously approved, by roll call, a collective bargaining agreement between the Boston School Committee and the Boston School Police Patrolmen Association effective from September 1, 2016 – August 31, 2020.

Approved – The Committee unanimously approved, by roll call, a Fiscal Year 2018 supplemental appropriation in the amount of $134,957 to cover the cost of the collective bargaining agreement between the Boston School Committee and the Boston School Police Patrolmen’s Association effective from September 1, 2016 – August 31, 2020.

Report and Action Items on Feeder Pathways in Mattapan and South Dorchester – Instructional Superintendent Mary Driscoll and Dr. Lisa Harvey, deputy director of evaluation and programs, Office of Engagement, presented the Superintendent’s proposal to add a second grade to the Mattapan Early Elementary School, and establish a feeder pathway from the P.A. Shaw Elementary School to the Mildred Avenue K-8 School, effective School Year 2018-2019. Akosua Osei-Bobie, principal of the P.A. Shaw Elementary School, shared her support for the plan and detailed her outreach with families.

Committee members expressed support for the plan. The Superintendent said that he will return the Committee on a later date with a report on the progress being made at the Mattapan Early Elementary School.

Approved – The Committee unanimously approved, by roll call, the Superintendent’s recommendation to expand the Mattapan Early Elementary School to grade K0-grade 2, effective School Year 2018-2019.

Approved – The Committee unanimously approved, by roll call, the Superintendent’s recommendation to create a feeder pathway from the P.A. Shaw Elementary School to the Mildred Avenue K-8 School, effective School Year 2018-2019.

Approved – The Committee unanimously approved, by roll call, the formation of a Risk Management/Internal Audit Task Force of the School Committee.
Approved – The Committee unanimously approved, by roll call, a motion to suspend Article II, Section 1 of its bylaws which would require the Committee to “convene its annual meeting on the first Monday in January of each year” and instead convene its 2018 organizational meeting on January 3, 2018.

REPORTS

FY 18 Update and FY19 Preview – Chief Financial Officer Eleanor Laurans provided a brief BPS fiscal update. The district closed Fiscal Year 2017 on budget and is currently projecting a $2.5 million deficit for FY18. She expressed confidence, however, that BPS will close that gap and close the current fiscal year on budget. Ms. Laurans also provided a brief, high-level preview of next year’s forthcoming FY19 budget proposal, which will include contractual raises for members of the Boston Teachers Union, additional supports for high-needs students, and measures to support schools with declining enrollment. She also explained how the Long Term Financial Plan is factoring into this budgeting process, along with the Budget Equity Working Group.

Committee members asked clarifying questions, all of which were answered by Ms. Laurans. Ms. Jeri Robinson thanked the Budget Equity Working Group, which includes several members of the Committee’s Opportunity and Achievement Gaps Task Force.

Mr. O’Neill asked Ms. Laurans to communicate to school leaders that the district is considering providing soft landings for schools with projected decline in enrollment.

PUBLIC COMMENT ON REPORTS

Megan Wolf, member, Quality Education for Every Student (QUEST), testified regarding school start times.

NEW BUSINESS

None.

ADJOURN

At approximately 12:57 a.m., the Committee voted by unanimous consent to adjourn the meeting.

Attest:

Elizabeth Sullivan
Executive Secretary